



---

**JUDGE JOHN RAYMOND MURPHY, PRESIDING.**

*El Shanti and El Nijjar v. Commissioner-General of the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees* 8U4392LB04710

---



---

---

---

**Submissions**

**Mr. El Najjar's Appeal**

---

---

**The Commissioner-General's Answer**

---

---

---

---

**Judgment**

*(Signed)*

*(Signed)*

*(Signed)*

*(Signed)*

---