

UNITED NATIONS APPEALS TRIBUNAL TRIBUNAL D'APPEL DES NATIONS UNIES

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393

Berhanemeskel Nega (Respondent/Applicant)

v.

Secretary-General of the United Nations (Appellant/Respondent)

JUDGMENT

Before: Judge Leslie F. Forbang, Presiding

Judge Kanwaldeep Sandhu

Judge Gao Xiaoli

Case No.: 2022-1763

Date of Decision: 27 October 2023

Date of Publication: 1 December 2023

Registrar: Juliet E. Johnson

Counsel for Appellant: Francisca Lagos Pola

Counsel for Respondent: Brandon Gardner, OSLA

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393

18. On 6 December 2022, the Secretary-General lodged an appeal of the impugned Judgment with the Appeals Tribunal

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393

submitted any evidence of support for such compensation, and that all he had provided was a transcript of expenses for the prior year (2021-2022) at St. John's University, and this transcript did not even contain the name of his daughter. Mr. Nega has also not shown that he met all of the eligibility requirements for the education grant. In sum, it was an error to consider the Administration's non-payment of the education grant when the UNDT made its compensatory award.

24. For the foregoing reasons, the Secretary-General requests that the UNAT reduce the award of compensation in lieu for Mr. Nega.

Mr. Nega's Answer

25. Mr. Nega submits that the Secretary-General has failed to demonstrate that the UNDT made an error of fact and/or law, or exceeded its competence in awarding him two years' net-base salary at level D-1 based on its finding that the Administration failed to make good faith efforts to place him in rtst23th9eedrd rd

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393

same thing as receiving a salary for services rendered. Mr. Nega avers that compensation in lieu serves a different purpose than payment for services rendered, and there is no rule barring a staff member from receiving compensation in lieu and a pension.

35. Mr. Nega also submits that the two years' net-base salary award does not come close to placing him in the same financial position that he would have been in had he been able to continue his service through to mandatory retirement age. He notes that he lost the ability to earn a full 2.5 years of salary, payments into his pension based on that salary, and education grants; as well as the possibility of a promotion to D-2 at even higher salary levels and higher pension contributions. Thus, even deducting for the pension payments received, he submits that he would still be entitled to the two years' net-base salary award from the UNDT. Mr. Nega also submits that he suffered moral damages by the Organization's failure to find him a suitable post notwithstanding his significant contributions to the Organization.

36.

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393

Considerations

- 40. We have before us an appeal against Judgment No. UNDT/2022/105 of the Dispute Tribunal rendered on 7 October 2022.
- 41. The orders of the Dispute Tribunal which constitute the main issue for determination before us are reproduced in relevant part as follows:¹²
 - ... [Mr. Nega] must be placed in a position among those he applied to of the same level to that one he had at the time of the abolition of his post.
 - ... The [Administration] is to pay to [Mr. Nega] the compensation in lieu of two years' net-base salary at the D-1 level as per the salary scale in effect at the time of [his] separation from service.
- 42. We note that the discretion of the Administration to restructure its organs is wide, but not unfettered. In its restructuring efforts, the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the discretion of the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration of the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration to restructure its organs is wide, but not unfettered. In its restructuring efforts, the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration to restructure its organs is wide, but not unfettered. In its restructuring efforts, the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration of the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration of the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration of the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration of the Administration of the Administration must comply with its the discretion of the Administration of the Administrat

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393

THE UNITED NATIONS APPEAL	-S I RIBUNAL
	Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393
two years' net-base salary at the D-1 level awarded to	
·	

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393 57. In light of our deference to the Dispute Tribunal in such matters, we find it an adof 2t(a)7 (ti)25.1 (TJ1 (3

Judgment No. 2023-UNAT-1393

compensation in lieu "is not compensatory damage based on economic loss. Thus, there is no reason to reduce this award by the amount of termination indemnity".³²

63. In that vein, we held further in Fasanella that "the UNDT erred in reducing Mr. Fasanella's in-lieu compensation by the amount of his termination indemnity, to which he has a right under Staff Regulations and Staff Rules".³³ And therefore, we concluded in that appeal that "the

	Judgment					
71.	The Secretary-General's ap	peal is dismissed,	and Judgment	No. UNDT/2022/1	05 is	
affirm	ed.					
Origin	al and Authoritative Version	: English				
Decisi	on dated this 27 th day of Octo	ober 2023 in New Y	ork, United Sta	tes.		
	(Signed)	(Signed)		(Signed)		
Ju	dge Forbang, Presiding	Judge Sandh	ıu	Judge Gao		
	nent published and entered fork, United States.	into the Register	on this 1st day	y of December 202	23 in	
	(Signed)					
Juli	iet E. Johnson, Registrar					