

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/145

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/198

6.

The * (tnesses * e+e not as, ed to g(/e s* o+n test(mon\$ no+ * e-e t&e\$ as, ed to s(gn an\$ *+(tten +e 'o+t o t&e(+ test(mon\$. .u)& a s&o+t)om(ng (n t&e (n/est(gat(/e '+o)ess ma\$ * e### (n ot&e+)(+umstan)es% g(/e +(se to <uest(ons :e(ng +a(sed a :out t&e (nteg+(t\$ o t&e (n/est(gat(on% 'a+t()u#a+#\$ g(/en t&e 'otent(a##\$ se+(ous)onse<uen)es o+ t&e sta mem:e+. =o*e/e+% t&e (nte+/(e*s *e+e +e)o+ded and t&e+e *as a s(gn(()ant deg+ee o)ons(sten)\$ and)o++o:o+at(on (n t&e a))ounts g(/en :\$ t&e *(tnesses and t&e do)uments '+odu)ed (n t&e)ou+se o t&e (n/est(gat(on.

11. @\$ #ette+ dated 14 9 a+)& 2014 % t&e A ' '#()ant *as (n o+med :\$ t&e D(+e)to+% 6A6G% t&at &e *as)ons(de+ed t&e su:-e)t o an (n/est(gat(on (nto a##egat(ons o med()a# +aud. 6A6G atta)&ed a)o'\$ o Van:+eda4s +e' o+t% a#ong *(t& t&e

and related provisions. The Commission (hereinafter referred to as the Commission) has found that the Commission's decision to award the contract to the respondent was not in accordance with the provisions of the Procurement Regulation.

17. @ \$ ema (# dated 1? 9 a+) & 2015 +om t&e Bega# . 'e)(a#(st% UN " P. % t&e A ' '#()ant *as +e<uested to ' +o/(de &(s)omments on t&e 6A6G +e' o+t *(t&(n ten *o+, (ng da\$. " n 24 9 a+) & 2015% t&e A ' '#()ant sent &(s)omments.

18. @ \$ ema (# o 16 A ' +(# 2015% t&e A ' '#()ant +e)e(/ed a)&a+ge #ette+ dated 15 A ' +(# 2015% s(gned on :e&a# o t&e De' ut\$ >;e)ut(/e D(+e)to+% UN " P. % +e<uest(ng t&e A ' '#()ant to su:m(t)omments. T&e #ette+ a#so noted t&at ' u+suant to 'a+a. 96 o " +gan(Cat(ona# D(+e)t(/e 01 " D23 No. !6% t&e A ' '#()ant &ad a +(g&t to)ounse# to ass(st &(m% and stated t&at an\$ su)&)ounse# *ou#d :e at t&e A ' '#()ant4s o*n e; 'ense.

19. @ \$ ema (# dated !0 A ' +(# 2015 (n +es' onse to t&e)&a+ge #ette+% t&e A ' '#()ant stated

A#t&oug& 6 *as not a:#e to ' +o/(de mu)& e/(den)e to su' ' o+t ou+ test(mon(es% (n t&e end 6 &a/e su:m(tted t&e)#a(m and t&e su' ' o+t(ng do)umentat(on t&at a+e not +e'+esentat(/e o t&e se+/()es m\$ *(e +e)e(/ed. And t&e a)t t&at 6 &a/e not :een d(#(gent enoug& to)a+e u##\$ ' +e' a+e t&e)#a(m and +e/(e* t&e su' ' o+t(ng do)umentat(on (s not an e;)use. T&e+e o+e% t&e)&a+ges 6 am a)(ng a+e unde+standa:#e and a(+. 6 am t+u#\$ so++\$ (m\$ a)t(ons &a/e)aused an\$ +e' utat(ona# damages to UN " P. .

20. @ \$ #ette+ dated 5 June 2015% s(gned :\$ t&e Bega# . 'e)(a#(st% UN " P. % on :e&a# o t&e De' ut\$ >;e)ut(/e D(+e)to+% and de#(/e+ed to t&e A ' '#()ant on 8 June 2015% t&e A ' '#()ant *as (n o+med t&at &(s a'

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/145

∴ .(n)e &e *as not su+e t&at #'o (##(ng *ou#d :e)o/e+ed and (n
a))o+dan)e *(t& 'age 1? o t&e 9 ed()a#% =os'(ta# and Denta# P#an% &e d(d
not s'e)(()a##\$ ment(on #'o (##(ng on t&e)#a(m% s(n)e t&e (ntent(on *as to

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/145

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/198

).

. The Director of Maternal and Child Health (MCH) in the Ministry of Health (MoH) is responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Reproductive Health (NPRH) and the National Strategy on Reproductive Health (NSRH). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Adolescent Reproductive Health (NAPRH) and the National Strategy on Adolescent Reproductive Health (NSARH). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Family Planning (NFP) and the National Strategy on Family Planning (NSFP). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Contraception (NPC) and the National Strategy on Contraception (NSC). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Safe Abortion (NSA) and the National Strategy on Safe Abortion (NSSA). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Maternal and Child Health (MCH) and the National Strategy on Maternal and Child Health (NSMCH). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Reproductive Health (NPRH) and the National Strategy on Reproductive Health (NSRH). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Adolescent Reproductive Health (NAPRH) and the National Strategy on Adolescent Reproductive Health (NSARH). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Family Planning (NFP) and the National Strategy on Family Planning (NSFP). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Contraception (NPC) and the National Strategy on Contraception (NSC). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Safe Abortion (NSA) and the National Strategy on Safe Abortion (NSSA). The MCH is also responsible for the implementation of the National Policy on Maternal and Child Health (MCH) and the National Strategy on Maternal and Child Health (NSMCH).

A ' ' # () ant 4 s + e < uest o + d (s) # osu + e o do) uments * as g + anted % and & e * as g (/ en t & e o ' ' o + tun (t \$ to (# e) omments on t & e add (t (on a # do) uments (# ed : \$ t & e 5 es ' ondent. @ ot & ' a + t (es * e + e a # so g (/ en t & e o ' ' o + tun (t \$ to (# e) # os (ng su : m (ss (ons.

! 1. = a / (ng + e / (e * ed t & e * & o # e) ase (# e % t & e T + (: una # (s sat (s (ed t & at on t & e : as (s o t & e * + (tten su : m (ss (ons and t & e am ' # e do) umenta + \$ e / (den) e on (# e % t & e + e (s no need o + a & ea + (ng.

" eei # ability

! 2. 6 t (s ' a + t o t & e A ' ' # () ant 4 s) # a (m t & at t & e den (a # o med () a # and denta # (nsu + an) e) o / e + age du + (ng t & e t & (+ t \$ da \$ s o) om ' ensat (on (n # (eu o not () e * as un # a * u #. . (n) e t & e A ' ' # () ant a (# ed to see , management e / a # uat (on o t & at de) (s (on % (t (s not + e) e / a : # e % rati one materiae 0 Eggesfield 2014 7 UNAT 74023.

" ele # ant law and \$ urisprudence

! ! . A + t () # e I o t & e Un (ted Nat (ons . ta 5 egu # at (ons ' + o / (des (n + egu # at (on 10.10a3 t & at 1 t & e . e) + eta + \$ 7 Gene + a # ma \$ (m ' ose d (s) (' # (na + \$ measu + es on sta mem : e + s * & o engage (n m (s) ondu) t 2.

! 4. . ta os (a (t) 0.874347 (&) 9 . 6 9 . 10a3 sttes t & ata 0] T J 7 9 . 23814 -3056 T d D [8 . (# u + e

. ta

!6.

(nd t&e (m'ugned adm(nst+at(/e de)(s(on to :e un+easona:#e% un a+% (#ega# (at(ona# 'o)edu+a##\$ (n)o++e)t% o+ d(s'+'o'o+(onate. Du+(ng t&(s 'o)ess t&e D(s'ute T+(:una# (s not)ondu)t(ng a me+(t7:ased +e/(e*% :ut a -ud()(a# +e/(e*. Jud()(a# +e/(e* (s mo+e)on)e+ned *(t& e;am(n(ng &o* t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+ +ea)&ed t&e (m'ugned de)(s(on and not t&e me+(ts o t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+4s de)(s(on. T&(s 'o)ess ma\$ g(/e an (m'+ess(on to a #a\$ 'e+son t&at t&e T+(:una# &as a)ted as an a' 'e##ate aut&o+(t\$ o/e+ t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+4s adm(nst+at(/e de)(s(on. T&(s (s a m(sunde+stand(ng o t&e de#()ate tas, o)ondu)t(ng a -ud()(a# +e/(e* :e)ause due de e+en)e (s a#*a\$ s&o*n to t&e de)(s(on7ma,e+% *&o (n t&(s)ase (s t&e .e)+eta+\$7Gene+a#.

41. In Hallal 2012 UNAT 720? 0'a+a. 283 t&e A' 'ea#s T+(:una# &e#d t&at (n a s\$stem o adm(nst+at(on o -ust())e go/e+ned :\$ #a*% t&e '+esum't(on o (nno)en)e &as to :e +es'e)ted% and t&at IG)Honse<uent#%\$ t&e Adm(nst+at(on :ea+s t&e :u+den o esta:#(s&(ng t&at t&e a##eged m(s)ondu)t o+ *&())& a d(s)('na+\$ measu+e &as :een ta,en aga(nst a sta mem:e+ o))u+ed2.

42. F(t& +es'e)t to t&e standa+d o '+oo a' '#\$(ng (n d(s)('na+\$)ases% t&e A' 'ea#s T+(:una# &e#d (n (ts Judgment Molari 2011 UNAT 7164 t&atA

10. D(s)('na+\$)ases a+e not)+(m(na#. B(:e+t\$ (s not at sta,e. @ut *&en te+m(nat(on m(g&t :e t&e +esu#t% *e s&ou#d +e<u(+e su)ent '+oo . Fe &o#d t&at% *&en te+m(nat(on (s a 'oss(:#e out)ome% m(s)ondu)t must :e esta:#(s&ed :\$)#ea+ and)on/(n)ng e/(den)e. C#ea+ and)on/(n)ng '+oo +e<u(+es mo+e t&an a '+e'onde+an)e o t&e e/(den)e :ut #ess t&an '+oo :e\$ond a +easona:#e dou:t K (t means t&at t&e t+ut& o t&e a)ts asse+ted (s &(g&# \$ '+o:a:#e.

&ere the Applicant/s due process rights respected*

41. In a' '#\$(ng t&e test set out (n (anwidi% t&e T+(:una# *(## (+st e;am(ne *&et&e+ t&e '+o)edu+a# +e<u(+ements o " D No. !6 0UN " P. Bega# 8+ame*o+, o+ add+ess(ng non7)om' #(an)e *(t& UN standa+d(s o)ondu)t% *e-e o##o*ed.

44. T&e (n/est(gat(on *as (n(t(ated on t&e :as(s o)on)e+ns +ega+d(ng t&e)#a(m (#ed :\$ t&e A' '#()ant on 25 Ju#\$ 2012% and a te+ Van:+eda &ad)onta)ted C#(n() EI Amen o:ta(n(ng)on (+mat(on t&at t&e)#(n())ou#d not aut&ent()ate t&e (n/o)e su:m(tted :\$ t&e A' '#()ant 0(n/o)e No. 12008863% and t&at% (n t&e+ /e*% (t *as a a,e do)ument. 8u+t&e+% D+. D.% t&e su+geon)on)e+ned% stated :\$ ema(# o

Case No.

UNDT/GVA/2015/145

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/145

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/198

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/145

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/198

5?. >/en (one *e+e to :e#(e/e t&at (t *as on#\$ u'on +e)e('t o t&e)&a+ge #ette+
t&at t&e A ' '#()ant +ea#(Ced t&at a su:stant(a# 'o+t(on o &(s)#a(m *as Ma
chirurgie4s)omm(ss(on +at&+ t&an med()a# ees o+ &(s *(e4s o'e+at(on t&e a)t
o t&e matte+ (s t&at (n &(s)#a(m to Van: +eda &e d(d not ma,e an\$ +e e+en)e to t&e
treatment t&at

Case No. UNDT/GVA/2015/145

Judgment No. UNDT/2016/198

d(s)('na+\$ measu+e (m 'osed on a sta mem:e+ :e 'o'o-t(onate to t&e g+a/(t\$ o
&(s o+ &e+ m(s)ondu)t.

68. T&e +e)ent '+a)t(e o t&e .e)+eta+\$7Gene+a# (nd()ates t&at se'a+at(on +om
se+/(e) * (t&)om'ensat(on (n #(eu o not()e and *(t&out te+m(nat(on ndemn(t\$ (s
)ons(de+ed a '+o'o-t(onate san)t(on (n)ases o su:m(ss(on o (nsu+an)e)#a(ms
t&at)onta(ned a#se (n o+mat(on 0. T/6C/2016/263.

69. T&e T+(: una# does not (nd t&at t&e+e a+e an\$ m(t(gat(ng)(+)umstan)es (n t&e